Rubrics and Decision Matricies

2017 July

Eric Johnson
Data Librarian
Miami University

Why do we make decisions?

- It’s better to do something than nothing?
- Because we want a better outcome?

Habitual decisions

- Let’s do what we’ve done before.

- But the world changes…
- How do people access books now vs. 20 years ago?

Gut responses

- Our brains and emotions process lots of information….
- Our decision is what makes us feel best.
- But that isn't necessarily the best decision.

Decision Effort

- Deciding takes effort!
- Is the result worth it?
- Campbell's soup – has years of experience, it's worth the 3 cents extra. – A "no brainer".
- New car – strong competition and cost. Worth thinking about.

Comparison spreadsheets

Ratings measured : Oct. 17, 2016	wave.webaim.org			**Accessibilty testing of web pages**								
Platform	**CONTENTdm MU postcard**	**CONTENTdm (OCLC featured collection)**	**CONTENTdm (OCLC featured collection)**	**CONTENTdm MU postcards**	**CONTENTdm MU folios**	**CONTENTdm MU Civil War Diaries**	**Preservica**	**Spec. webstite**	**Preservica**	**Preservica**	**Spec. webstite**	**Spec. webstite**	**Preservica**
URL	http://digital.lib.miam	http://tript ych.brynm	http://digital.library.	http://digital.lib.miam	http://digital.lib.miam	http://digital.lib.miam	http://ww w.suffolkar	http://spec .lib.miami	https://ww w.tsl.texas	http://e-archives.sc	http://spec .lib.miami	http://spec .lib.miami	https://dig ital.nmla.
Errors (missing alt. t	10	2	17	7	3	3	0	0	12	2	0	0	3
Alerts	87	80	62	54	53	48	31	39	10	9	13	12	5
Features	67	79	61	52	49	49	31	59	12	2	8	8	2
Structural Elements	86	91	73	69	67	66	26	13	7	16	13	13	4
HTML5 and ARIA	13	1	1	1	1	1	15	0	5	3	0	0	2
Contrast Errors	10	15	12	11	10	11	18	0	13	16	0	0	10
	http://wave.webaim.or		http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave	http://wave.webaim.or		http://wave
Total Errors:	**273**	**268**	**226**	**194**	**183**	**178**	**121**	**111**	**59**	**48**	**34**	**33**	**26**
	Less Accessible <---------- **More Accessible**												

Websites tested with the Web Accessibility Evaluation Tool. wave.webaim.org

CONTENTdm examples came from MU special collections and OCLC's examples. https://www.oclc.org/contentdm/collections.en.html

Preservica examples came from their examples page. http://preservica.com/customised-universal-access-examples/

"ARIA" is Accessible Rich Internet Applications

Web pages were selected by taking all the featured examples from CONTENTdm and Preservica. MU examples were top of page examples returned from searching for Miami and Special collections, annd the Special Collections A-Z and Digital Collections portal.

What if Analysis

CONTENTdm - Preservica price comparison tool				Enter Collection size to compare prices				
	display collection size in GB	800	800	800	1500	2000	3000	
	backup or preservation in GB	0	800	2000	1000	3000	4000	
	Current yearly MU storage and VM cost: $2200 for 2000 GB	$2,200	$2,200	$2,820	$2,588	$4,525	$6,075	
CONTENTdm	annual fee	7999	7999	7999	7999	7999	7999	
	collection storage - first 30 GB							
	collection storage - up to 100 GB							
	collection storage - up to 200 GB							
	collection storage - up to 400 GB							
	collection storage - up to 800 GB	5500	5500	5500				
	collection storage - up to 1000 GB							
	collection storage - up to 1500 GB				6885			
	collection storage - per additional 1.5 TB					6885	6885	
	"Preservation" storage - first 30 GB							
	"Preservation" storage - up to 100 GB							
	"Preservation" storage - up to 200 GB							
	"Preservation" storage - up to 400 GB							
	"Preservation" storage - up to 800 GB		5500					
	"Preservation" storage - up to 1000 GB				6120			
	"Preservation" storage - up to 1500 GB							
	"Preservation" storage - per additional 1.5 TB			6885		6885	13770	
	additional OCR processing- 10,000 pages per month							
	Other features are billed as needed							
	Total for hosted CONTENTdm	**$13,499**	**$18,999**	**$20,384**	**$21,004**	**$21,769**	**$28,654**	**$0**
	Total with 1st year 20% discount	**$10,799**	**$15,199.20**	**$16,307**	**$16,803**	**$17,415**	**$22,923**	**$0**
Preservica	up to 250GB							
	up to 500GB							
http://preservica	1 +TB	11950	11950	11950	11950	11950	11950	
	additional TB in Amazon S3			1450	1450	2900	4350	
	additional TB in Amazon Glacier			550	550	1100	1650	
	greater than 10TB							
	Total for Preservica cloud - all S3, full preservation	**$11,950**	**$11,950**	**$13,400**	**$13,400**	**$14,850**	**$16,300**	**$0**
	Total for Preservica cloud - 1st TB S3, the rest Glacier	**$11,950**	**$11,950**	**$12,500**	**$12,500**	**$13,050**	**$13,600**	**$0**

Million dollar decision

- Our dean tells hiring committees that they are making a million dollar decision.

- Over the course of a career, we will pay that person a million dollars.

Imperfect Knowledge

- Nobody knows the future.
- Nobody knows everything about now.
- It is even hard to know ourselves.
- How can we judge a job candidate?

Game theory

- Conflict and cooperation.
- Choosing between equal options with many unknown factors.
- Makes for exciting game play.
- But exhausting committee meetings.

Differences in opinion

- Even when everyone on the committee has the same facts, we disagree.

- ~~Arguments~~ Decisions can take hours.

If only there were a guide…

- Teachers have been grading students for centuries.

- They use RUBRICS

- Guidelines for what to expect and points to award for meeting expectations.

How to build a rubric

- Decide what is important (select criteria)
- How important is each criterion? (weights)
  - “Must have” qualities (high weight)
  - Desired qualities (medium weight)

Rubric for Presentations

CATEGORY	WEIGH	ELEMENT	POOR (1)	MARGINAL (2)	GOOD (3)	EXCELLENT (4)
Title	10	Interesting Title	Title is dull or too wordy.	Title is awkward	Title is interesting	Title gains the reader's interest, is captivating.
	10	Informative Title	Title gives little information about the session.	Title gives some indication of the session's content.	Title generally describes what the session will be about.	Title clearly describes the session
Description	10	Descriptive writing	Description is unclear or difficult to follow.	Description generally describes the session.	Description is clearly written.	Description is very well written.
	10	Description details	Description lacks sufficient details.	Description could use additional details or information.	Description provides adequate details of the session	Description provides detailed information about the session.
Proposal	10	Proposal clarity	The way in which the abstract is written indicates that the delivery of the presentation may be poor.	The way in which the abstract is written suggests that the delivery of the presentation may be weak.	The abstract is clearly written and suggests that the quality of the presentation will be good.	The proposal abstract is well written and indicates that the presentation will be of professional quality.

What is important?

- For that positon, proposal or solution:

- “Applicant must be able to …”
- “Presentation proposal will appeal to …”
- “The software platform is open source.”

- These become a list of criteria

Split big things up

- “Applicant must be able to use office software, write HTML code and lift 50 pounds.”

1. … is able to use office software.
2. … is able to write HTML code.
3. … is able to lift 50 pounds.

- Makes it easier to evaluate

Decide importance

Applicant is able to…	Professional Assistant	Programmer	Mail clerk
Use office software	8	8	3
Write HTML code	5	10	0
Lift 50 pounds	2	2	10

Importance depends on the job!

Evaluate:
Score each person on each attribute (1 to 10)

Programmer position	Weight	Angie	Bill	Cassie
Use office software	8	4	3	10
Write HTML code	10	9	2	8
Lift 50 pounds	2	9	7	4

Calculate score

Programmer position	Weight	Angie	Bill	Cassie
Use office software	8	4	3	10
Write HTML code	10	9	2	8
Lift 50 pounds	2	9	7	4
Score		**140**	**58**	**168**

=SUMPRODUCT($B$2:$B$4,C2:C4)

Add color scale

Programmer position	Weight	Angie	Bill	Cassie
Use office software	8	4	3	10
Write HTML code	10	9	2	8
Lift 50 pounds	2	9	7	4
Score		**140**	**58**	**168**

Excel: Highlight cells -> Conditional formatting -> color scales.

Negative traits = negative weight

Programmer position	Weight	Angie	Bill	Cassie
Use office software	8	4	3	10
Write HTML code	10	9	2	8
Lift 50 pounds	2	9	7	4
Demanding	-6	6	4	3
Score		**104**	**34**	**150**

Essential = high weight

Programmer position	Weight	Angie	Bill	Cassie
Use office software	8	4	3	10
Write HTML code	10	9	2	8
Lift 50 pounds	2	9	7	4
Has degree	100	10	10	0
Score		**1140**	**1058**	**168**

Rubric scores are a guide

- Not every characteristic is easy to quantify
- Using a rubric takes practice
- Update the rubric to match your final decision process.

What about committees?

1. Each person fills out a rubric
2. Each person has a tab in a Google doc
3. Summary tab adds the scores

Judge summary

Programmer position		Angie	Bill	Cassie
Score Judge 1		1140	1058	168
Score Judge 2		1082	1130	40
Score Judge 3		1104	1082	130
Average score		1109	1090	113
Score range		58	72	128

- Use the score range to see difference of opinion
- Those are people/topics for discussion

Committee discussion

1. Figure out the weights before judging
2. Rubrics are a starting point
3. Select candidates for further discussion
4. Compare final decision with scores
5. Develop rubric weight and criteria to match committee's decision

Personal Decisions

- Works the same way
- Put daily tasks on the top
- Goals on the rows (personal, job, etc.)

Personal Decisions

My Job	Weight	Email	Reference Desk	Write Article
Core Mission		Value	Value	Value
Helps Patrons		Value	Value	Value
Job Advancement		Value	Value	Value
Score				

- Weight is how important that criteria is.
- Values are how much task advances criteria.

Break big tasks up

My Job	Weight	Patron Emails	Reference Desk	Article – Research
Core Mission				
Helps Patrons				
Job Advancement				
Score				

Tasks should be small enough to finish that day

- Email – from patron, supervisor, or listserv
- Write Article – research subtopic, get quote about xx.

Costs

- Some tasks are quick,
  - Others take time
- Dollars, time, emotional energy, etc.
  - Add costs row
- Then calculate score per cost
- Useful for administrators also

Costs

	Benefit Weight	Patron Emails	Ref. Desk Shift	Write Article
Core Mission	8	5	8	5
Helps Patrons	6	10	10	2
Job Advancement	2	1	2	9
Score		102	126	70
Time (minutes)		20	120	60
Benefit per minute		5.1	1.1	1.2

Each person will have their own weights and values

Use your intelligence

- Is the rating reasonable?
  - If not, adjust the criteria
- Learn from previous decisions
- Incorporate your experience

Questions?

Eric Johnson – Data Librarian, Miami University